

Ives, The Unanswered Question (1908)

according to Kirkpatrick's catalog, the ms. dates from before 1907, probably summer of 1906. Catalog Number lc25

first published in Boletin Latino-Americano de Musica, 1941

neg. q2870 is sketch of Unanswered Question

this is on score paper (fold) given over to ms. of the song "In My Beloved's Eyes" (ca. 1895). ~~xxx~~ This location seems to be irrelevant to dating; Ives evidently just used the available empty page -- scrap paper.

Originally intended to go with Central Park in the Dark (1906)
On the full score, in Ives' hand:

"These two pieces were first entitled:

I. A Contemp~~o~~ation of a Serious Matter or The Unanswered Question

II. A Contemplation of Nothing Serious or Central Park in the Dark in 'The Good Old Summer Time'"

Also called Largo to Presto "The Unanswered Question"

Ives - The Unanswered Question
Preparatory materials

4-17 (m. 16 m. 17) [102210]

Melodic (7, 10, 11, 2) (11, 2, 3, 6)

Question 1 (3 minor 3rds) 5-10 [

4-21 [111111]

same invariant pes as in transp. of 4-17 (A-B)

(7, 11, 4, 2) (11, 0, 2, 6) IT₂

2 Forms of Question

originally (in sketch)

5-10 [223111]
↑
11

5-212 [222121]

4-13 (Berg's motto)
[112011]
↑

Kirkpatrick Catalog - The Unanswered Question

p. 44 - main entry

p. 170 - sketch with 8B22E (In my Beloved's Eyes)

for original association with Central Park in the Dark see p. ~~170~~ 45

~~Images quoted: 4632-37~~

negatives: 94632-37 (p. 261)

92870 score - sketch

Ives, The Unanswered Question (1908)

84

- 1.2, 7, 11,
- 2.2, 7, 11,
- 3.2, 7, 11,
- 4.2, 6, 11,
- 5.2, 6, 11,
- 6.4, 7, 11,
- 7.4, 7, 11,
- 8.2, 7, 11,
- 9.2, 5, 7, 11,
- 10.0, 2, 4,
- 11.0, 4, 7,
- 12.0, 4, 7,
- 13.0, 4, 7,
- 14.0, 4, 7,
- 15.2, 4, 7, 11,
- 16.2, 4, 7, 11,
- 17.0, 4, 9,
- 18.0, 4, 9,
- 19.0, 4, 9,
- 20.0, 4, 9, 11,
- 21.0, 4, 9,
- 22.0, 2, 4, 9,
- 23.0, 4, 9,
- 24.0, 2, 4, 9,
- 25.0, 4, 9,
- 26.2, 7, 11,
- 27.0, 2, 7, 11,
- 28.2, 7, 11,
- 29.2, 7, 9, 11,
- 30.2, 7, 11,
- 31.2, 7, 11,
- 32.2, 3, 7, 11, 2, 7, 10, 11,
- 33.2, 3, 7, 11, 2, 7, 10, 11,
- 34.1, 2, 7, 11,
- 35.2, 4, 7, 11,
- 36.2, 3, 7, 11,
- 37.2, 3, 6, 11,
- 38.0, 2, 6, 11,
- 39.2, 6, 11,
- 40.2, 6, 11,

- 41.2, 6, 11,
- 42.4, 7, 11,
- 43.4, 7, 11,
- 44.2, 7, 11,
- 45.2, 5, 7, 11,
- 46.0, 2, 4,
- 47.0, 2, 4, 5,
- 48.0, 2, 4, 5, 6,
- ✓ 49.0, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7,
- ✓ 50.0, 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7,
- ✓ 51.0, 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11,
- 52.0, 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11,
- 53.0, 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11,
- 54.0, 3, 4, 6, 7, 11,
- 55.0, 3, 4, 6, 7, 11,
- 56.0, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 11,
- 58.0, 4, 7,
- 59.0, 4, 7,
- 60.0, 4, 7,
- 61.2, 4, 7, 11,
- 62.2, 4, 7, 11,
- 63.0, 4, 9,
- 64.0, 4, 9, 10,
- 65.0, 4, 9, ~~11~~ 10,
- 66.0, 1, 4, 9,
- 67.0, 4, 9,
- 68. ~~0, 2, 4, 9~~ 0, 4, 9,
- 69. ~~0, 2, 4, 9~~ 0, 3, 4, 9,
- 70. ~~0, 2, 4, 9, 11~~ 0, 3, 4, 9, 11,
- 71.0, 3, 4, 9, 11,
- 72.0, 3, 4, 9,
- 73.0, 4, 9, 11,
- 74. ~~0, 2, 4, 9~~ 0, 2, 4, 9,
- 75. ~~0, 2, 4, 9~~ 0, 4, 9,
- 76.0, 2, 4, 9,
- 77.0, 4, 9,
- 78.2, 7, 11,
- 79.0, 2, 7, 11,
- 80.2, 7, 11,
- 81.0, 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 11,
- 82.0, 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 9, 11,

check this

Ives, contd.

83.0,1,2,5,6,7,9,11,
84.0,1,2,7,8,11,
85.0,2,7,8,11,
86.0,2,7,8,11,
87.0,2,7,8,11,
88.0,2,7,9,10,11,
89.0,2,7,9,10,11,
90.0,2,7,8,11,
91.2,7,11,
92.2,7,11,
93.0,2,7,9,
94.0,2,7,9,
95.2,7,11,
96.2,6,11,
97.2,6,10,11,
98.2,6,10,11,
99.1,2,6,11,
100.2,4,6,11,
101.2,3,6,11,
102.2,3,6,11,
103.0,2,6,11,
104.0,2,6,11,
105.2,6,11,
106.2,6,11,
107.0,4,7,
108.0,4,7,
109.0,4,7,8,9,11,
110.0,4,7,8,9,11,
111.0,4,7,8,9,11,
112.0,4,5,7,8,9,
113.0,4,7,8,9,
114.0,4,7,8,9,11,
115.0,4,7,11,
116.0,4,6,7,11,
117.0,2,4,6,7,
118.0,1,2,4,5,7,
119.0,1,2,4,5,7,
120.0,2,5,7,
121.0,4,7,
122.0,4,7,
123.0,4,7,
124.0,2,4,7,
125.0,2,5,9,
126.0,5,9,
127.0,5,9,10,

128.0,5,9,10,
129.0,1,5,9,
130.0,4,5,9,
131.0,3,5,9,
132.0,3,5,9,
133.0,5,9,11,
134.0,5,9,
135.0,5,9,11,
136.4,7,11,
137.0,4,7,8,9,11,

SET-COMPLEX RELATIONS FOR ALL "QUESTIONS"

	3-11
4-13	K
4-14	KH
4-17	KH
4-18	KH
4-19	KH
4-20	KH
4-22	KH
4-26	KH
4-29	KH
4-229	KH

4-17 missing

		4-13	4-14	4-18	4-19	4-20	4-22	4-26	4-27	4-219								
5-10	K	KH	K	K		K	K	K	K	K								
5-22	K	KH	K	K			K	K	K	K								
5-16	KH	K		KH	K	K		K	K	KH								
5-218	KH	K	KH	KH	K	K	K	K	K	K								
5-28	KH	K		K	K		K		KH	KH								
5-30	KH		K	K	KH	K	KH	K	K	K								
5-31	KH	KH		KH				K	KH	K	5-10	5-212	5-16	5-218	5-28	5-30	5-31	
11 6-210	KH	K	K	K	K		K	K	K	KH			K	K				
10 6-219	KH		K	KH	KH	KH		K	K	K			K	K				
10 6-224	KH	K	KH	K	K	K	KH	K	KH		K					K		
9 6-27	KH	KH		KH				KH	KH	KH	KH		KH					KH

5-218 & 4-27

5-10 with C
 5-212 with Bb

①

B^b 4-17 {7, 10, 11, 2} ~~atonal~~
 C# 4-229 {7, 11, 1, 2} atonal
 E^b 4-26 {11, 2, 4, 7} "diatonic"
 E^b 4-19 {7, 11, 2, 3} atonal
 E^b 4-17 {11, 2, 3, 6} atonal
 C# 4-229 {11, 0, 2, 6} atonal

5-237 {
 E^b 4-19 {7, 11, 2, 3} atonal
 E^b 4-17 {11, 2, 3, 6} atonal
 C# 4-229 {11, 0, 2, 6} atonal

T₄
 IT₁

6-27: {10, 11, 1, 2, 4, 7}
 6-219: {11, 0, 2, 3, 6, 7}
 4-19 with B^b instead of C

②

B^b 4-229 {9, 10, 0, 4} atonal
 C# 4-17 {9, 0, 1, 4} atonal
 E^b B-11 {9, 0, 4} ~~tonal~~ diatonic - the triad
 E^b 5-218 {9, 11, 0, 3, 4} atonal
 B^b 4-14 {9, 11, 0, 4} diatonic (minor scale segment)

T₁₀
 T₁₀

5-16: {9, 10, 0, 1, 4} 7-16 is last question
 5-218: {9, 11, 0, 3, 4}
 4-229 with B^b instead of B#

③

B^b 4-19 {10, 11, 2, 6} atonal
 C# 4-14 {11, 1, 2, 6} tonal
 E 4-22 {11, 2, 4, 6} tonal
 E^b 4-17 {11, 2, 3, 6} atonal
 C# 4-229: {11, 0, 2, 6} atonal

6-224: {10, 11, 1, 2, 4, 6}
 5-16: {11, 0, 2, 3, 6} T₂
 4-19 with B^b instead of B#

④

B^b 4-14 {5, 9, 10, 0} diatonic
 C# 4-19 {5, 9, 0, 1} atonal
 E^b 4-20 {4, 5, 9, 0} diatonic
 E^b 4-27 {9, 0, 3, 5} diatonic
 B^b 4-229 {5, 9, 11, 0}

6-219: {9, 10, 0, 1, 4, 5}
 5-28: {9, 11, 0, 3, 5}
 (4-16 with B^b)

5

B \flat 4-27: {4, 7, 10, 0} *diatonic*
 C# 4-18: {0, 4, 7} *diatonic*
 E \natural 3-11: {0, 4, 7} *diatonic*
 E \flat 4-19: {3, 4, 7, 11} *diatonic*
 C \natural 3-11: {5, 9, 0} *diatonic*

5-31: {4, 7, 10, 0, 1}
 7-30: {3, 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 0}

6 B \flat 4-229: {9, 10, 0, 4}
 C# 4-17: {9, 0, 1, 4}
 E \natural 4-22: {9, 0, 2, 4} *diatonic*

6-210: {9, 10, 0, 1, 2, 4}

E \flat 4-13: {9, 0, 2, 3}
 F \natural 4-14: {0, 2, 3, 7} *diatonic*

6-224: {7, 9, 11, 0, 2, 3}
 IT,

[4-13 = T₁₁ of original form of question]

4-22 with B \flat

7 B \flat 4-17: {7, 10, 11, 2}
 C# 4-229: {7, 11, 1, 2}
 E \natural 4-26: {11, 2, 4, 7}
 E \flat 4-19: {7, 11, 2, 3}
 B \natural 3-11: {7, 11, 2}

6-27: {10, 11, 1, 2, 4}

7-16: {7, 10, 11, 1, 2, 3, 4}

4-17 with B \flat

3-11	4-13	5-10	6-210
	4-14	5-212	6-219
	4-17	5-16	6-224
	4-18	5-218	6-27
	4-19	5-28	
	4-20	5-30	
	4-22	5-31	
	4-26		
	4-27		
	4-29		

Rhythmic Structures - triplet multiplication ("Isorhythmic aspects")

Two - Unanswered?

Rhythmic Strata!



First Question

Set 4-17

IVES, Unanswered?

	Normal Order:	0	3	4	7	0	3	4	7
T32		7	10	11	2	11	2	3	6
T37	(±4)	11	2	3	6				
	Differences	4	4	4	4				

Set 4-229

Normal orders

T34 (A)	7	11	1	2	0	4	6	7
T38 (B)	11	0	2	6	0	1	3	7

Thus, I-related:

	7	11	1	2
	6	2	0	11
Sums	1	1	1	1
$B = T(I(A), 1)$				$\Rightarrow IT_1$

Same invariant pos in both cases: pos 2, 11

[Invariants] - see below

Interval Vectors, T32-T38 FIRST QUESTION

Bb	32	4-17	0 2 2 0
C#	34	4-229	1 1 1 1 1
E	35	4-26	0 1 2 1 2 0
E ^b	36	4-19	1 0 1 3 1 0
E ^b	37	4-17	1 0 2 2 1 0
C	38	4-229	1 1 1 1 1 1

- a } {7, 10, 11, 2}
- b } {7, 11, 1, 2}
- c {11, 2, 4, 7} Use these letter designations (?)
- d {7, 11, 2, 3}
- a } {11, 2, 3, 6}
- b } {11, 1, 2, 6} with B^b instead of C[#], as in autograph, this is 4-19

[Invariants under transposition can be read from vector]

Vertical Sets, T64-T70 (Second statement of Question)

	Name	Normal Order	Vector	
	T64	4-229	9, 10, 0, 4	111111 b
	T66	4-17	9, 0, 1, 4	102210 a
	T69	4-18 3-11	9, 0, 1, 4	102111 e-new
	T70	5-218	9, 11, 0, 3, 4	212221 f-new
Strings also	(T74)	4-22	9, 0, 2, 4	021120

(~~4-18 occurs also at T57, last simultaneous of first answer~~)
 - distinct 4-229 with B^b, no in autogroups

[Subsets of 5-218?]

Vertical Sets, T97-103 (Third statement of Question)

	Name	Normal Order	Vector	
	T97	4-19	10, 11, 2, 6	101310 d
	T99	4-14	11, 1, 2, 6	111120 g new
	T100	4-22	11, 2, 4, 6	021120 h new?
	T101	4-17	11, 2, 3, 6	102210 a
	T103	4-229	11, 0, 2, 6	111111 b
Strings also	(T109)	3-11	0, 4, 7	001110

Vertical Sets, T127-133 (Fourth statement of Question)

	Name	Normal Order	Vector	
	T127	4-14	5, 9, 10, 0	111120 g
	T129	4-19	5, 9, 0, 1	101210 d [normal order problem in case of 4-19]
	T130	4-20	4, 5, 9, 0	101220 i (new)
	T131	4-27	9, 0, 3, 5	012111 j (new) dominant 7th, half-dim. 7th
	T133	4-229	5, 9, 11, 0	111111 b
Strings also	(T136)	3-11	4, 7, 11	

Vertical Sets, Sixth Statement of Question

	Name	Normal Order	Vector	
(B ¹)	4-229	9, 10, 0, 4	11111	b
(C#)	{ 4-17 4-4	9, 0, 1, 4	102210	a
		9, 0, 1, 2	211110	le new
(E)	4-22	9, 0, 2, 4	021120	h
(E ^b)	{ 4-13 3-10 4-12	9, 0, 2, 3	112011	d (new)
		9, 0, 3	502001	(dir. tied)
		9, 0, 2, 3,	112011	m (new)
(B)	4-14	7, 11, 0, 2	111120	g (3rd question)

13 different instructions

Vertical Set, Final Statement of Question - same as first statement except for last (3-11)

(B¹)

(C#)

(E)

(E^b)

(B) 3-11

Differences between sketch and final version

1. The question is same succession each time:

Bb-C#-E-Eb-Bb set 4-13 (same as Berg's motto - Chamber Orch. k
piece)
in final version ♯ with C is 5-10, ♯ with B is 5-Z12 (5-236)

2. Answer: some changes in notes
D, not Db in Ans. 1

maximally similar (Pz)

changes in register

3. Program notes

String Q. keeps very even time!

Fl. Q. " " uneven " !

Fl. Q. gets over its excitement suddenly

4. Sketch much more condensed than final version.